



Robert Green
Senior Planning Officer
Development Management
Winchester City Council
City Offices
Colebrook Street
Winchester
SO23 9LJ

10th August 2018

Dear Mr Green

Ref: 18/01337/FUL Development of a gas powered standby generation facility and associated infrastructure (for a period of 25 years from date of commissioning)

I am sorry to take up more of your time by writing to you again, but on 31st July Ms Bethany Kington of Enzygo, the developer's agents, responded to the Bishop's Waltham Parish Council objection to this development. Two things in this response concern us.

As I said in my email of 5th August, but not in our letter of 3rd August, we found the comments submitted by the apparently independent engineer Mr Philip Downing of Basingstoke very interesting. In particular he pointed out that:

“My interpretation of the information on Siemen's website is that the SGE86 engine is a prototype. It has only ever been run on a testbed and has never been installed in a packaged generator set...

This is relevant because the Noise Impact Assessment document in the application is based on the noise level of the generator set. If a similar set has not been built and subjected to a noise measurement test then the stated noise levels must be regarded as preliminary. The noise levels will not be confirmed until the first set is built and tested.

Siemen's website states that the engine is of a novel design and is larger than any of their existing range of engines. I suggest that it would not be safe to extrapolate the noise data from that of a generator set with a smaller engine.”

In her response to the Parish Council, Ms Kington states that “A detailed set of technical assessments have been submitted as part of the planning application, among these a noise assessment and air quality assessment. These reports assess the impacts of the proposed development on residents and other receptors, and utilise standard methodologies based on nationally available standards and guidance. All technical data has been provided by the technology supplier...” (Our emphasis)

As we said in our letter of 3rd August, we are not technical experts, but it does seem that a reliance on technical data from Siemens for a prototype that has never actually been tested (if Mr Downing is right) is a jump in the dark and reinforces the need for a Precautionary Principle approach. The same, of course, goes for noxious emissions. Here Mr Downing found a big discrepancy between Siemens and Enzygo's figures.

The second concern is what I can only describe as a very disingenuous part of the Enzygo response. Ms Kington states that “It should also be noted that similar schemes are submitted across the country with very little public interest, and the level of interest generated in relation to this application is unprecedented.” (Our emphasis)

She goes on to say, “We are working closely with the Local Authority to ensure residents have access to accurate information and fully understand what the development entails. (Again our emphasis)

It has been brought to our notice that the people of Bishop’s Waltham are not so very unusual in objecting to this type of proposal. Let us take two examples:

South Lakeland District Council has had a similar application from Stratera Energy that has had approximately 500 objections:

<http://applications.southlakeland.gov.uk/planningapplications/detail.asp?AltRef=SL/2018/0388>

Perhaps more pertinent - and more disappointing in terms of “accurate information” - is an application to Stratford-upon-Avon Council for a generator at Alcester which has received 3-400 objections. And the Agent? None other than Enzygo!

<https://apps.stratford.gov.uk/eplanning/AppDetail.aspx?appkey=P7UHJ7PMKI400>

Perhaps Ms Kington should talk to her work colleague Mr Lee Searles about precedents. We are disappointed to find that “accurate information” is a possible aim, rather than a reality!

On a final, very positive note, can I thank you for making sure that Tracy Matthews’ consultation response of 17th July has now been posted online. We are reassured by her proposals.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Tony Kippenberger', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Tony Kippenberger
Chairman

cc: Alan Inder, Jonathan Simmons, Pauline Mousley
cc: Tracy Matthews Historic Environment Officer (Archaeology)